

Planning Committee

Thursday 10 December, 2009

PRESENT:

Councillor Lock, in the Chair.
Councillor Mrs. Stephens, Vice-Chair.
Councillors Mrs. Bowyer, Delbridge, M. Foster (substitute for Councillor Roberts), Fox, Nicholson, Stevens, Thompson, Tuohy, Vincent and Wheeler.

Apologies for absence: Councillor Roberts.

The meeting started at 2.30 p.m and finished at 5.15 p.m.

Note: At a future meeting, the committee will consider the accuracy of these draft minutes, so they may be subject to change. Please check the minutes of that meeting to confirm whether these minutes have been amended.

60. WELCOME

The Chair welcomed Councillor Thompson as a new Committee Member.

61. DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST

The following declarations of interest were made in accordance with the Code of Conduct in relation to items under discussion at this meeting –

Name	Minute No. and Subject	Reason	Interest
Councillors Stevens, Tuohy and Wheeler	65.2 – Car Park, Woodside, Plymouth 09/01443/FUL	Know the applicant's agent	Personal

62. MINUTES

Resolved that the minutes of the meeting held on 12 November, 2009, be confirmed as a correct record.

63. CHAIR'S URGENT BUSINESS

Speaking at Committee

The Chair reminded Committee Members of the need to ensure their microphones were switched on when speaking as it had been difficult to hear some of their comments at the last meeting. He also reminded those members of the public who were in attendance to speak that they must adhere to the 5-minute time limit and that he would be strictly enforcing the new procedure.

(In accordance with Section 100(B)(4)(b) of the Local Government Act, 1972, the Chair brought forward the above item of business because of the need to inform Committee Members and members of the public).

64. QUESTIONS FROM MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC

In accordance with Part Two, Paragraph 10, of the Constitution, the following question was submitted –

Question No. 1 09/10

Question By Mr. Woolley LLB MA (Hons)

<p>Since April 2007, has the PC (or officer(s) under delegated powers) refused development permission [i] for student accommodation (purpose-built or HMO-conversion) in Mutley/Greenbank wholly or partly because this conflicted with the CS aim of providing a sustainable or balanced community[ii]; (b) if not is this aim applicable to Mutley/Greenbank?</p> <p>[i] i.e. any permission that the Committee has power to grant [ii] see Strategic Objective 10.1 p 113 CS and para 10.33 lines 19 to 23</p>
<p>Response:</p>
<p>A detailed analysis of all applications granted since April 2007 has not been possible in the timeframe, but officers are unaware of an application for purpose built student accommodation being refused based on Core Strategy Policy CS01 (Sustainable Linked Communities). The reference to the Core Strategy referred to in the question relates to HMOs rather than student accommodation. The Local Planning Authority does not have control over occupation of a house by students unless it takes it outside the Use Class C3 use (ie a dwelling house). Applications for self contained student accommodation are looked at on their own merits and particular reference should be made to the Development Guidelines SPD (Consultation draft) paragraph 2.170. The SPD supports purpose built student accommodation provided it is well designed and suitably located to minimise any negative impacts on residential amenity. This will be particularly relevant in the Mutley/Greenbank area where the amount of family accommodation is being eroded by conversions into student accommodation without the need for planning permission. The provision of self contained student accommodation is one way to redress this problem.</p>

Resolved that the written response be passed to the elector.

65. **PLANNING APPLICATIONS FOR CONSIDERATION**

The Committee considered the following applications, development proposals by local authorities and statutory consultations submitted under the Town and Country Planning Act, 1990, and the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act, 1990.

Addendum reports were submitted in respect of minute numbers 65.1, 65.2, 65.3, 65.4 and 65.5.

65.1 FORMER CARDINAL SERVICE STATION, WOLSELEY ROAD, SEGRAVE ROAD, PLYMOUTH 09/01375/FUL
(Brook St. Properties Ltd.)
Decision:
Application **GRANTED** conditionally, subject to S106 Obligation, Delegated Authority to refuse in event of S106 not signed by 23 December, 2009.

(Councillors Stevens, Tuohy and Wheeler declared personal interests in respect of the above item).

(At the invitation of the Chair, the Committee heard representations against the application).

65.2 CAR PARK, WOODSIDE, PLYMOUTH 09/01443/FUL
(Mr. Essy Kamie)
Decision:
Application **GRANTED** conditionally, subject to S106 Obligation, and inclusion of an additional informative to ensure new residents would not receive residents' parking permits, Delegated Authority to refuse in event of S106 not signed by 23 December, 2009.

(At the invitation of the Chair, the Committee heard from Councillor Ricketts, Ward Member, speaking against the application).

(At the invitation of the Chair, the Committee heard from the applicant's agent).

65.3 FORMER TOTHILL SIDINGS, LAND SOUTH OF KNIGHTON ROAD, PLYMOUTH 09/01409/OUT

(Reliant Building Contractors Ltd.)

Decision:

Application **REFUSED** for the reasons set out in the report and the additional reasons contained within the addendum report (conditions 11 and 12).

(At the invitation of the Chair, the Committee heard from the applicant's agent).

(Councillor Nicholson's proposal to defer for further consideration, having been seconded by Councillor Stevens, was put to the vote and declared lost).

65.4 29-30 REGENT STREET, GREENBANK, PLYMOUTH 09/01070/FUL

(Mr. and Mrs. Ian Crabb)

Decision:

Committee Members were of the opinion that there was insufficient space within the building to satisfactorily provide the number of student bed spaces proposed. As a result of this, the rooms would be of an inadequate size, and unable to accommodate the items usually held by students in full-time education, and unable to provide a satisfactory standard of amenity for future occupiers. Therefore, the proposal was contrary to policy CS15 (sub-paragraph 5) of the Plymouth Local Development Framework Core Strategy (2006-2021) 2007.

Application **REFUSED** for being contrary to Policy CS15 (sub-paragraph 5).

(At the invitation of the Chair, the Committee heard from Councillor Ricketts, Ward Member, speaking against the application).

(At the invitation of the Chair, the Committee heard representations against the application).

(At the invitation of the Chair, the Committee heard from the applicant's agent).

65.5 1 ST. LAWRENCE ROAD AND 14 HOUNDISCOMBE ROAD, PLYMOUTH 09/01302/FUL

(Mr. Dave Hendy)

The Committee was advised that, in addition to the comments contained in the addendum report, a further letter of representation had been received from Linda Gilroy MP.

Decision:

Application **DEFERRED** for a site visit under criteria 1.

(At the invitation of the Chair, the Committee heard from Councillor Ricketts, Ward Member, speaking against the application).

(At the invitation of the Chair, the Committee heard from the applicant's agent).

(Councillor Nicholson's proposal to defer for a site visit under criteria 1, having been seconded by Councillor Wheeler, was put to the vote and declared carried).

66. PLANNING APPLICATION DECISIONS ISSUED

The Committee received a report of the Assistant Director of Development (Planning Services) on decisions issued for the period 3 to 30 November, 2009, including –

- Committee decisions
- Delegated decisions, subject to conditions where so indicated
- Applications withdrawn
- Applications returned as invalid

Resolved that the report be noted.

67. **APPEAL DECISIONS**

The Committee received a schedule of decisions made by the Planning Inspectorate on appeals arising from the decisions of the City Council.

Resolved that the report be noted.

68. **EXEMPT BUSINESS**

There were no items of exempt business.

VOTING SCHEDULE

PLEASE NOTE

A SCHEDULE OF VOTING RELATING TO THE MEETING IS ATTACHED AS A SUPPLEMENT TO THESE MINUTES.

Minute Annex

PLANNING COMMITTEE

DATE OF MEETING – 10 December, 2009

SCHEDULE OF VOTING

Minute No.	Voting For	Voting Against	Abstained	Excluded from voting due to Interests Declared	Absent
6.1 Former Cardinal Service Station, Wolseley Road, Segrave Road, Plymouth 09/01375/FUL Officer recommendation	Unanimous				
6.2 Car Park, Woodside, Plymouth 09/01443/FUL Officer recommendation	Councillors Mrs. Bowyer, Delbridge, Michael Foster, Lock, Nicholson, Mrs. Stephens, Stevens, Thompson, Tuohy, Vincent and Wheeler	Councillor Fox			
6.3 Former Tothill Sidings, Land south of Knighton Road, Plymouth 09/01409/OUT Proposal to Defer Officer recommendation	Councillors Nicholson and Stevens Councillors Mrs. Bowyer, Delbridge, Fox, Michael Foster, Lock, Mrs. Stephens, Thompson, Tuohy, Vincent and Wheeler	Councillors Mrs. Bowyer, Delbridge, Fox, Michael Foster, Lock, Mrs. Stephens, Thompson, Tuohy, Vincent and Wheeler	Councillors Nicholson and Stevens		
6.4 29-30 Regent Street, Greenbank, Plymouth 09/01070/FUL Officer recommendation	Councillors Lock, Nicholson, Mrs. Stephens and Thompson	Councillors Mrs. Bowyer, Delbridge, Fox, Michael Foster, Stevens, Tuohy, Vincent and Wheeler			
6.5 1 St. Lawrence Road and 14 Houndiscombe Road, Plymouth 09/01302/FUL Proposal to Defer Officer recommendation	Unanimous N/A				Councillor Vincent

This page is intentionally left blank